

Christian Gold: Effektivität von Musiktherapie mit Kindern und Jugendlichen – erste Ergebnisse einer Multicenter-Studie

ÖBM Jour fixe, 2002

Die Ergebnisse des in diesem Vortrag vorgestellten Forschungsprojekts, an dem mehrere Musiktherapeuten in Österreich mit ihren Klienten beteiligt waren, wurden von 2001 bis 2007 in verschiedenen internationalen Fachzeitschriften publiziert. Die Abstracts dieser fünf englischsprachigen Artikel sind unten in chronologischer Reihenfolge wiedergegeben. Zusätzlich wurde 2005 auch eine deutschsprachige Zusammenfassung und Diskussion der Ergebnisse veröffentlicht, das Abstract dieses Beitrags ist hier am Ende ebenfalls wiedergegeben. Die Studie ist außerdem auch in der Doktorarbeit des Autors (2003) ausführlich beschrieben.

Einige der Artikel sind im Volltext auf der Homepage des Autors (www.uib.no/people/cgo022) zu finden, die übrigen Artikel sind vom Autor direkt erhältlich (christian.gold@grieg.uib.no, c.gold@magnet.at).

1.)

Gold, C., Wigram, T., & Berger, E. (2001). The development of a research design to assess the effects of individual music therapy with mentally ill children and adolescents. Nordic Journal of Music Therapy, 10(1), 17-31.

Abstract:

This paper introduces a research design to measure effects of individual music therapy with mentally ill children and adolescents on symptoms, competencies, and quality of life. In a pilot project, seven children (five boys and two girls, 4 to 11 years of age) who suffered from various mental and behavioural problems were assessed. Five children received music therapy, and two did not. The two groups were compared with regard to the kind and severity of their problems. The main therapeutic aspects of music therapy were the children's needs for relationship and presence and opportunities for emotional expression. At post-treatment, the children who received music therapy were improved in all three outcome domains. Through the pilot study, the sensitivity and relevance of the instruments and the feasibility of a parallel no-treatment control group could be confirmed, and further details of the research design could be clarified. The results support the continuation of this research with a larger sample.

2.)

Gold, C. (2004). The use of effect sizes in music therapy research. Music Therapy Perspectives, 22(2), 91-95.

Abstract:

Music therapy outcome research frequently involves comparisons between groups on continuous scales of psychological constructs. Describing such differences only through statistical tests reduces the existing complexity and creates an artificial and potentially misleading dichotomy. The interpretation of the magnitude of a difference found on a psychological scale is often not straightforward, but can be greatly facilitated and improved by using effect sizes. Cohen's (1988) benchmarks allow for intuitive judgements and enable comparisons between different scales. An example of a study of the effects of music therapy on self-esteem shows how the use of effect sizes can change the interpretation of a research result. Effect sizes have important applications in many fields of music therapy research, including primary studies as well as meta-analyses, and planning of research as well as reporting of research results. Because of their intuitiveness, they may help to bridge the "gap" between research and clinical practice.

3.)

Gold, C., Voracek, M., & Wigram, T. (2004). *Effects of music therapy for children and adolescents with psychopathology: A meta-analysis. Journal of Child Psychology and Psychiatry and Allied Disciplines, 45(6), 1054-1063.*

Abstract:

Background: The objectives of this review were to examine the overall efficacy of music therapy for children and adolescents with psychopathology, and to examine how the size of the effect of music therapy is influenced by the type of pathology, client's age, music therapy approach, and type of outcome. Method: Eleven studies were included for analysis, which resulted in a total of 188 subjects for the meta-analysis. Effect sizes from these studies were combined, with weighting for sample size, and their distribution was examined. Results: After exclusion of an extreme positive outlying value, the analysis revealed that music therapy has a medium to large positive effect (ES = .61) on clinically relevant outcomes that was statistically highly significant ($p < .001$) and statistically homogeneous. No evidence of a publication bias was identified. Effects tended to be greater for behavioural and developmental disorders than for emotional disorders; greater for eclectic, psychodynamic, and humanistic approaches than for behavioural models; and greater for behavioural and developmental outcomes than for social skills and self-concept. Conclusions: Implications for clinical practice and research are discussed.

4.)

Gold, C., Wigram, T., & Voracek, M. (2007). *Effectiveness of music therapy for children and adolescents with psychopathology: A quasi-experimental study. Psychotherapy Research, 17(3), 292-300.*

Abstract:

Music therapy has been found to be effective for children and adolescents with psychopathology, but its effectiveness in routine practice is unknown. The aim of this study was to examine whether individual music therapy as provided in outpatient services is an effective treatment for this group of clients and to examine potential predictors of its effectiveness. The authors assessed symptoms, competencies, and quality of life in children and adolescents with psychopathology (N = 136) before and after up to 25 weekly sessions of individual music therapy or corresponding waiting time. No significant interaction effects were identified, although quality of life showed a tendency in favor of music therapy. Effect sizes were smaller than in previous experimental research. Effects on symptoms depended on the presence and severity of comorbid medical conditions. The results suggest that music therapy as provided in routine practice is effective for some but not all groups of clients.

5.)

Gold, C., Wigram, T., & Voracek, M. (2007). *Predictors of change in music therapy with children and adolescents: The role of therapeutic techniques. Psychology and Psychotherapy: Theory, Research and Practice, 80(4), 577-589.*

Abstract:

Music therapy has been shown to be efficacious in experimental studies. However, there is little empirical research knowledge about what elements of music therapy influence its effectiveness in clinical practice. Children and adolescents with psychopathology (N = 75) were assessed before and after participating in individual music therapy with 1 out of 15 music therapists in the Vienna region. Relationships between outcomes (as evaluated by parents) and therapy contents (as reported by therapists) were examined using general linear modelling. Results indicated that clients'

symptoms and burdens on their social environment showed greater improvement when music therapy was limited to discipline-specific music therapy techniques and did not include other media such as play therapy elements. The findings indicate the importance of being aware of a therapy method's specific strengths and limitations. More research on the indicated specific ingredients of music therapy intervention is needed.

6.)

Gold, C. (2005). Was beeinflusst die Effektivität von Musiktherapie bei psychisch kranken Kindern und Jugendlichen? [What influences the effectiveness of music therapy with psychologically disturbed children and adolescents?]. In Berufsverband der Musiktherapeutinnen und Musiktherapeuten in Deutschland (Ed.), Jahrbuch Musiktherapie (pp. 147-158). Wiesbaden, Germany: Ludwig Reichert.

Abstract:

Der Bedarf an Wirksamkeitsforschung in der Musiktherapie wurde bisher zumeist mehr als eine Forderung von außen wahrgenommen denn als eine Fragestellung, die sich aus eigenem fachlichem Interesse ergibt. Mit einer Reihe von Studien hat der Autor versucht, auf die Frage nach der Wirkung der Musiktherapie im Bereich der Kinder- und Jugendpsychiatrie Antworten zu finden, die auch für die klinisch-musiktherapeutische Arbeit relevant sind.

Im ersten Teil, einer Meta-Analyse, wurden alle weltweit verfügbaren Studien neu zusammengefaßt und neben dem durchschnittlichen Effekt auch die Rolle potentieller Prädiktoren (Art der Klienten und musiktherapeutischer Ansatz) untersucht. Im zweiten Teil, einer Effektivitätsstudie, wurden klinische Veränderungen während einer Einzelmusiktherapie bzw. Wartezeit bei insgesamt 136 Kindern und Jugendlichen erfaßt. Dabei stand neben der durchschnittlichen Effektivität wiederum die Frage im Vordergrund, welche Variablen die Wirksamkeit besonders beeinflussen.

Das Ergebnis der Meta-Analyse zeigte ein äußerst positives Ergebnis: Elf Studien mit 188 Probanden zeigten zusammen einen deutlichen Effekt. Die Frage nach den Einflüssen von Störungsbild und musiktherapeutischem Ansatz konnte nicht endgültig geklärt werden. In der Effektivitätsstudie wurde die musiktherapeutische Arbeit im klinischen Alltag untersucht. Hier zeigten sich wichtige Einflußfaktoren hinsichtlich der Wirksamkeit: Die Klienten verbesserten sich am meisten, wenn die Musiktherapie auf die musikalische Interaktion und die verbale Aufarbeitung fokussiert war. Die Ergebnisse der Studien leisten einerseits einen Beitrag zur oft geforderten wissenschaftlichen Evidenz für die Wirksamkeit von Musiktherapie. Darüber hinaus liefern sie auch für die Praxis wichtige Anregungen und können dazu beitragen, die Lücke zwischen Forschung und Praxis zu verringern.